

JEECAR Peer Review Form

Manuscript Code: _____

Manuscript Title: _____

Referee's Name: _____

Date: _____

Content:

Is the paper technically sound? If no, why not?

_____ Yes _____ No

Is the coverage of the topic sufficiently comprehensive and balanced?

_____ Yes
_____ Important information is missing or superficially treated.
_____ Certain parts are too in-depth.

How would you describe the technical depth of the paper?

_____ Superficial
_____ Suitable for the non-specialist
_____ Appropriate for the Generally Knowledgeable Individual Working in the Field
_____ Suitable Only for an Expert

How would you rate the technical novelty of the paper?

_____ Novel _____ Somewhat Novel _____ Not Novel

Structure:

How would you rate the overall organization of the paper?

_____ Satisfactory _____ Could be improved _____ Poor

Are the title and abstract satisfactory?

_____ Yes _____ No (explain)

Is the length of the paper appropriate? If not, recommend how the length of the paper should be amended, including a possible target length for the final manuscript.

_____ Yes _____ No

Are symbols, terms, and concepts adequately defined? If not, please identify items that require further definition.

_____ Yes _____ Not always _____ No

How do you rate the English usage?

_____ Satisfactory _____ Needs Improvement _____ Poor

How do you rate the References?

_____ Satisfactory _____ Unsatisfactory (explain)

Overall Recommendation:

- ___ Publishable as it is.
- ___ Publishable with minor revision specified in "Comments" section.
- ___ Reject, but encourage re-submitting with major revisions specified in "Comments" section.
- ___ Reject without further consideration.

Detailed Comments:

Please use this space to explain overall ratings or to go into further detail on ratings from the Content and Structure sections. If you have indicated that revisions are required, please give the author specific guidance regarding those revisions, differentiating between optional and mandatory changes. Feel free to attach extra sheets of comments and to make notes on the manuscript.
